

CASA Board of Directors Meeting **December 13, 2018, Edmonton, Alberta**

In attendance:

CASA Board Members and Alternates:

Alison Miller, Petroleum Products	Leigh Allard, NGO Health
Ann Baran, NGO Rural	Martin Van Olst, Federal Government
Benjamin Israel, NGO Industrial	Rich Smith, Agriculture
Bill Calder, NGO Urban	Rick Blackwood, Provincial Government – Environment (morning only)
Brian Ahearn, Petroleum Products	Robert Stokes, Provincial Government – Environment (afternoon only)
Claude Chamberland, Oil and Gas Large Producers	Ruth Yanor, NGO Industrial
Dan Moore, Forestry	Wayne Ungstad, NGO Rural
Greg Moffatt, Chemical Manufacturers	Andre Asselin, CASA Executive Director
Holly Johnson-Rattlesnake, Samson Cree Nation	
Jim Hackett, Utilities	

CASA Secretariat:

Katie Duffett, Cara McInnis, Anuja Ramgoolam, Matt Dance, Kim Sanderson

Guests:

Jenna Curtis, Sharon Willianen, Sushmitha Gollapudi, Marilea Pattison Perry, Hamid Namsechi, Salina Fairbank; Alberta Environment and Parks (AEP)
Afrooz Farjoo; Alberta Energy
Karen Raven, Len Kryzanowski; Alberta Agriculture and Forestry
Merry Turtiak, Brendan Schiewe; Alberta Health
Colin Robb, Capital Power
Tasha Blumenthal, Rural Municipalities of Alberta
Sheila Witwicky, National Growth Partners

Presenters:

Andre Asselin, *2019 Core Operating Budget (Item 1.4), 2019 Operational Plan (Item 1.5)*
Randy Dobko and Jim Hackett, *Electricity Framework Review Project Team (Item 2)*
Alison Miller and Laura Blair, *Ambient Air Quality Objectives Project Team (Item 3)*

Regrets:

David Lawlor, Alternate Energy	Scott Wilson, NGO, Consumer
Kathy Rooyakkers, Local Government – Rural	James Baldwin, Chemical Manufacturers
Keith Murray, Forestry	
Mary Onukem, Indigenous Peoples - Métis	
Rob Beleutz, Mining	

**Clean Air Strategic Alliance
Board of Directors Meeting
December 13, 2018**

Executive Summary

Board members attended a dinner the evening prior to the meeting to recognize retiring directors and alternates.

A number of administrative items were addressed, with the board deciding to align the terms of executive members with the last board meeting of the calendar year. Terms will continue to be staggered. As well, the board approved the 2019 core operating budget and the 2019 operational plan. Three board meetings are planned for 2019.

The Electricity Framework Review project team is undertaking the third five-year review of the 2003 Electricity Management Framework. The team prepared an interim report and perspectives on the NO_x emission standard for gas-fired turbines, with two key areas of non-consensus:

- At what threshold or configuration should emission standards be set based on the capabilities of add-on control such as selective catalytic reduction
- Treatment of cogeneration units vs. combined cycle

The board approved the transmission of the 2018 CASA Electricity Framework Review Interim Report: *Perspectives on a NO_x Emission Standard for Natural Gas-Fired Turbines* to Alberta Environment and Parks, with the addition of a perspective from the Forestry sector which was not provided in supplementary package due to time constraints, as advice for their consideration and to inform next steps.

The Ambient Air Quality Objectives project team presented the results of work on H₂S/TRS. It reviewed the H₂S 1-hour daily maximum and 24-hour AAQOs. Although agreement was reached in a number of areas, the team concluded that application of a TRS Guideline was outside the mandate of the project team and was a barrier to full consensus. Concern was expressed about the possibility of using a TRS guideline for compliance and modelling purposes, recognizing that its intent is for odour management. The various perspectives were compiled and the board approved the transmittal of the *Hydrogen Sulphide(H₂S) and Total Reduced Sulphur (TRS) Advice to the Government of Alberta* and attached perspectives documents to AEP to inform their decision making.

Three reports were received for information. The board then had a discussion of next steps in its strategic planning process, following up on the session earlier in the fall. An ad hoc governance committee will be convened by February to develop its Terms of Reference for a review of CASA's governance, as discussed at the strategic planning session. Staff will draft a strategic plan in time for the April 2019 meeting.

**Clean Air Strategic Alliance
Board of Directors Meeting
December 13, 2018, Edmonton, Alberta**

Meeting Notes

Jim Hackett convened the business meeting at 9:34 a.m.

1 Administration

1.1 Convene Meeting and Approve Agenda

The chair welcomed everyone, noting that the meeting was occurring on the traditional lands of Treaty 6 First Nations and the Métis. He thanked staff for organizing the event last night, and reviewed safety procedures and logistics for the venue.

Jim briefly reviewed the agenda for the meeting, noting that information reports appear at the end of the agenda in order to focus discussion on more substantive items. The agenda was adopted as presented.

1.2 Actions and Minutes from September 28, 2018 Board Meeting

The minutes of the September 28, 2018 meeting were adopted by consensus. The four action items from that meeting are completed, as noted in the briefing package. A concern was noted that some members who are sent hard copies of the briefing book via mail did not receive the package as soon as normal. There was also a suggestion that page numbering be improved to make it easier to navigate through the material. This briefing package was especially large and complex, with a number of late adjustments due to the intense stakeholder interest. The secretariat will continue to make every effort to get the briefing package to board members two weeks prior to the meeting.

1.3 Executive Membership and Terms

Decision: The board approved aligning executive committee representatives' terms to the last board meeting of the year.

The NGO caucus selected Bill Calder as its executive committee representative for a second two-year term, which requires approval by the board.

Decision: The board agreed to appoint Bill Calder for a second two-year term on the executive.

1.4 2019 Core Operating Budget

Andre Asselin presented the draft core operating budget for 2019, which was previously reviewed and approved by the executive committee. The budget of \$750,200 is predicated on a full workload and full staffing. Andre noted ongoing issues with IT due to the amalgamation and advised that he continues to work with lawyers to define a policy with respect to use of recreational marijuana. He reviewed the allocations to each major budget category and responded to questions.

Discussion

- We know there will be a provincial election in the coming months and budget dynamics for CASA will be affected given that the bulk of the organization's funding comes in an operational grant. If the election is called early, the GoA may not even table a budget.
- It would be helpful in future to break out the salary portion of the budget.
- It might be useful to see a regular balance sheet to improve board oversight.
 - Expenses are shown in the executive director's report at each board meeting and a balance sheet can be added to that report. If board members want more details between meetings, they should contact Andre directly.

Decision: The board approved the proposed 2019 core operating budget.

1.5 2019 Operational Plan

Andre presented the draft 2019 Operational Plan as described in the briefing package and reviewed by the executive committee. The Plan lays out activities for 2019 for the board, executive committee, project teams and working groups.

Discussion

- We should keep in mind the importance of outreach and coordination with other agencies to manage communications. This work was started and should be continued so our messages can be carried by other organizations. Information about air literacy is important to the public to create a better understanding of the issues.

Decision: The board approved the 2019 Operational Plan.

1.6 2019 Meeting Dates

It was noted that the meeting locations in the schedule proposed in the briefing package should be reversed, with the April and December meetings in Calgary (not Edmonton) and the September meeting in Edmonton (not Calgary). Venues have been booked for these dates and locations. Both venues are heavily used and it is crucial to confirm dates well ahead.

Discussion

- It would be preferable to have the December meeting in Edmonton since attendance is usually better.
- December 12-13 would be a better date than December 5-6.

Action 1: Staff will investigate the option of booking the federal building in Edmonton for Dec. 12-13.

Decision: The board approved holding the April 25 meeting in Calgary and the September 12 meeting in Edmonton. A date and location for the December meeting will be approved in April.

2 Electricity Management Framework Review Project Team

Randy Dobko and Jim Hackett presented an update from the EFR project team, which is undertaking the third five-year review of the 2003 Electricity Management Framework. The project scope is informed by recommendations from the original framework and subsequent reviews. Following non-consensus from the 2015 review, there was a request to go back to stakeholders, knowing that the regulatory landscape had changed dramatically. With major changes in the sector, stakeholders agreed earlier in 2018 that they needed to have an open discussion to ensure the EMF reflects the circumstances of the day. This was a very intense process throughout phase 1, which was scheduled for completion in December 2018. Phase 2 was scheduled to begin in January 2019 and be completed by mid-2019. However, some Phase 1 tasks could not be completed in this timeline. The team will assess remaining tasks and time required in Q1 2019 and provide an update at the first board meeting of 2019. In the work to date, the team has used the capacity of team members whenever possible to complete tasks. The team prepared an interim report and perspectives on the NOx emission standard for gas-fired turbines and proposes that this report be transmitted to the GoA as advice for their use in decision making.

Key areas of non-consensus were:

- At what threshold or configuration should emission standards be set based on the capabilities of add-on control such as selective catalytic reduction
- Treatment of cogeneration units vs. combined cycle

The team also summarized the following lessons learned for future short-term projects:

- Specific, well defined project scope and clear direction for project outcomes required
- Information needs either well scoped prior to the project or already available
- Exploration of an alternative format for projects which are not likely to reach consensus may ease tension; e.g., conferences, information sharing, or a forum to bring forward perspectives with the aim of understanding viewpoints rather than consensus
- Participation in good faith is essential

Bill Calder took the chair for the discussion and thanked the presenters and the team for their work.

Discussion

- Five facilities in Alberta use selective catalytic reduction at present.
- The forestry sector (AFPA) had not provided a perspective letter to CASA in time for inclusion in the board package, but supports proposal B and will submit a perspective following the meeting.

Decision: The board approved the transmission of the 2018 CASA Electricity Framework Review Interim Report: Perspectives on a NOx Emission Standard for Natural Gas-Fired Turbines to Alberta Environment and Parks as advice for their consideration and to inform next steps; the transmission will include a note that the Alberta Forest Products Association supports Proposal B.

Jim Hackett resumed chairing duties.

3 Ambient Air Quality Objectives Project Team

Alison Miller and Laura Blair reviewed the project timelines and mandate, and the work done to date by the active subgroups. The team is reviewing and advising on AAQOs for six substances, and is on schedule for all reviews, with PM and ozone complete. The NO₂/SO₂ subgroup is exploring modelling concerns before developing a draft recommendation and is targeting the April or September meeting for a decision request. Any board members or sectors with concerns about NO₂ are encouraged to engage with their representative(s) on the team. Work on SO₂ will start in Q1 of 2019. The H₂S/TRS subgroup has been working for about 18 months. It reviewed the H₂S 1-hour daily maximum and 24-hour AAQOs. The subgroup and the project team reached agreement in the following areas:

- The current H₂S AAQOs are protective of health
- The current H₂S AAQOs do not adequately address odour
- There is a gap in management tools available to address odour
- A 30-minute TRS Guideline of 5 ppb (7µg/m³) would be useful as an odour management tool (the AAQO would be 5 ppb)

However, application of a TRS Guideline was outside the mandate of the project team and was a barrier to full consensus. In particular, industry was not comfortable with the possibility of using a TRS guideline for compliance and modelling purposes, recognizing that its intent is for odour management. The team explored adding some text to the AAQO to say that it would not be used for compliance approval but the GoA was not comfortable with that wording. Guidelines are not meant to be used in approvals, but rather in airshed planning as an air quality management tool. As well, airsheds noted some concerns with respect to reporting requirements. The various perspectives were compiled for transmission to AEP.

Discussion

- There is a comment that agriculture is not directly affected as it is covered by AOPA. A board member expressed a concern about that statement.
 - Under EPEA, odours from agriculture are excluded if the operator is using generally accepted management practices. A TRS guideline would not apply to agriculture because it is an odour-based number.

Decision: The board approved the transmittal of the Hydrogen Sulphide(H₂S) and Total Reduced Sulphur (TRS) Advice to the Government of Alberta and attached perspectives documents to AEP to inform their decision making.

This team and its subgroups were acknowledged for their good work.

4 Information Reports

The following reports were provided in the briefing package as information:

- GoA Update
- ROVER III Project Team

- Executive Director's Report

Questions:

Q: There is reference in the executive director's report to a meeting with DM Bev Yee. Was there anything that can be shared with the board from that meeting?

A: It was largely a "meet and greet" for Andre and a chance to re-orient Bev to the work of both CASA and the AWC.

Q: In the GoA report, under the report from Agriculture and Forestry near the top of page 4, there is reference to the estimated ammonia and PM emissions from CFOs. Are there actual emissions data, rather than "estimated"?

A: Actual data should be available.

Action 2: AEP will follow up with Agriculture and Forestry to determine what ammonia and PM emissions data are available.

Q: Item 9 regarding the AER does not address wellsite reclamation.

A: AER is part of the GoA's IRMS and participates with other departments on issues related to cumulative effects management. The orphan well issue is recognized as important. The AER has also gone to the Supreme Court to challenge some decisions to ensure that producers are accountable even if they go bankrupt.

Q: Is there any update regarding funding for the ROVER III project?

A: Environment and Climate Change Canada has provided \$100,000 in funding to the ICCT; those funds will flow to the ROVER III project and apply to data collection. The paperwork for the funding is being processed now. The data collection task is now over-funded, so we will get more data as a result.

The board commended the GoA for the comprehensive report it provided to the board.

New/Other Business

There was no new or other business.

Bill Calder took the chair.

5 Strategic Planning Next Steps

The board welcomed Sheila Witwicky to lead the afternoon session on strategic planning follow-up. The intent was to first secure board agreement that the summary of the workshop provided by National Growth Partners accurately represents the findings of the earlier strategic planning session and for the board to approve the report as the guiding document to develop the strategic plan. The board would then consider how to advance the work. Building on the previous discussion, the board agreed on the following four strategic priorities:

- Governance Review
- A Sustainable Business and Economic Model of CASA
- Excellence in Air Quality Management Advice and Tools

- Strengthen Stakeholder Reach, Involvement and Relationships

Action 3: Sheila and staff will update the summary document to reflect today’s discussions and append more detailed notes from the strategic planning and today’s discussion to the summary prior to distributing them to the board.

Action 4: Staff will develop a first draft of the new Strategic Plan that focusses on the non-governance strategic priorities for the April 2019 board meeting.

Action 5: Staff will send out a call for members for the CASA Governance Committee by February 2019.

Action 6: The ad hoc Governance Committee will develop draft terms of reference for the Committee for board consideration at its April meeting, and begin early stages of the Governance review as time permits.

6 Evaluation Forms

Members were asked to complete meeting evaluation forms for review by the executive. In future, executive members will share the results of the forms with their caucuses. Completed evaluation forms are also posted on the CASA website.

The next CASA board meeting will be in Calgary on April 25, 2019.

The meeting adjourned at 2:40 p.m.

Action Item	Responsible	Due
Action 1: Investigate the option of booking the federal building in Edmonton for Dec. 12-13.	CASA staff	April 11
Action 2: Follow up with Agriculture and Forestry to determine what ammonia and PM emissions data are available.	AEP	December 21
Action 3: Update the summary document to reflect today’s discussions and append more detailed notes from the strategic planning and today’s discussion to the summary prior to distributing them to the board.	Sheila Witwicky and CASA staff	December 21
Action 4: Develop a first draft of the new Strategic Plan that focusses on the non-governance strategic priorities for the April 2019 board meeting.	CASA staff	April 11
Action 5: Send out a call for members for the CASA governance committee by February 2019.	CASA staff	February 2019

Action 6: Develop draft terms of reference for the Governance Committee for board consideration at its April meeting, and begin early stages of the Governance review as time permits.	Ad hoc Governance Committee	April 11, 2019
--	-----------------------------	----------------